## **DEPARTMENT OF DEFENSE**



## **Strategy**

on

## **Environmental Justice**

March 24, 1995

#### **CONTENTS**

#### **Section**

**1 SUMMARY REPORT** 

2 STRATEGY ON ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE

**3 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN** 

#### **Attachments**

A Executive Order 12898 and accompanying Presidential Memorandum

B List of Acronyms

#### SECTION 1 SUMMARY REPORT



#### INTRODUCTION

On February 11, 1994, President Clinton issued an Executive Order entitled *Federal Actions to Address Environmental Justice in Minority Populations and Low-Income Populations*. The measure requires Federal agencies to identify and address disproportionately high and adverse human health and environmental effects of Federal programs, policies, and activities on minority and low-income populations.

The Department of Defense (DoD) has developed a strategy that identifies the major programs and areas of emphasis it believes can best meet the intent of the Executive Order, minimize any adverse effects on the human health and environment of minority and low-income populations, and carry out the defense mission. DoD's strategy is outlined in <a href="Section 2">Section 2</a> of this document. The implementation plan outlined in <a href="Section 3">Section 3</a> describes the specific steps DoD will take to execute this strategy.

DoD's strategy and implementation plan are designed to allow for change as DoD identifies new opportunities and initiatives and modifies or enhances existing or proposed initiatives. Aspects of the plan may change in response to new directions from the Administration and the Interagency Working Group on Environmental Justice (IWG) chaired by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). In addition, DoD plans to implement the Executive Order principally through its compliance with the provisions of the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA).

DoD's strategy focuses on implementing institutional changes, rather than one-time projects, to ensure that a healthy and safe environment exists around DoD activities that are located in or near minority and low-income populations. To that end, DoD will operate in accordance with the following principles:

- Promote partnerships with all stakeholders
- Identify the impacts of DoD activities on minority and low-income populations
- Streamline government
- *Improve the day-to-day operations of installations*
- Foster nondiscrimination in DoD programs

Existing environmental and civil rights statutes provide opportunities to address environmental hazards and economic opportunities. DoD recognizes that application of

existing statutory provisions is an important part of its efforts to ensure that its programs, policies, and activities do not have the effect of excluding persons from participating in, denying persons the benefits of, or subjecting persons to discrimination under such programs because of their race, color, or national origin.

#### INTERNAL ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS

In the 12 months since the Executive Order was issued, DoD has undertaken and completed many actions to establish a decision-making infrastructure through which to implement provisions of the Executive Order:

- DoD identified the Office of the Deputy Under Secretary of Defense (Environmental Security) to lead the development of the strategy and to oversee implementation provisions of the Executive Order. DoD also established a DoD-wide Committee on Environmental Justice (CEJ) to develop, help implement, and monitor DoD's environmental justice activities. The CEJ is made up of senior level staff who will guide the implementation of environmental justice within DoD. In addition, each of the DoD military departments and key defense agencies has identified an office that will execute the requirements and goals of the Executive Order within their department.
- DoD established mechanisms for working with the IWG and has actively participated on the task force committees established to assist the IWG in implementing the provisions of the Executive Order. DoD co-chairs the IWG Task Force Committee on Outreach.

DoD will continue to build a foundation to support the integration of environmental justice into its programs, policies, and activities. Specific actions are:

- DoD continue the CEJ as a formal forum for guiding the process for implementing the strategy.
- DoD will evaluate its progress toward implementing the Executive Order on an annual basis, using the framework of the *Defense Environmental Quality Annual Report to Congress* to collect information and report progress.
- DoD will establish an accountability system for identifying and monitoring
  environmental justice activities. DoD military departments, defense agencies, and
  defense field activities will hold periodic reviews to assess progress and share
  lessons learned. As part of their self-audits, each will conduct a review of its
  operations, activities, and land use to determine whether disproportionately high and
  adverse human health and environmental effects on minority and low-income
  populations living near the installation have been addressed.

#### PROGRAMS, POLICIES, AND PLANNING PROCESSES UNDER REVISION

- DoD will use NEPA as the primary mechanism to implement the provisions of the Executive Order. When appropriate, environmental assessments, environmental impact statements, and records of decision will evaluate the potential environmental effects (including human health, economic, and social) of its actions on minority and low-income populations. To encourage efforts to streamline government and eliminate duplication, DoD will coordinate with other Federal agencies to improve data collection and research needed to support environmental analysis.
- DoD will strengthen the community relations plan (CRP) as a tool to understand the socioeconomic makeup of the populations in and around its operations. Installations will combine data gathered from interviews with members of the local community with information gathered from the U.S. Bureau of the Census and various databases maintained by the military departments, defense agencies, and other agencies such as the EPA and local and tribal governments. Where this information does not exist, DoD will coordinate with other Federal, state, local, and tribal governments to develop the data.
- DoD will continue to maintain its data exchange and information network, known as the Defense Environmental Network Information Exchange (DENIX), to encourage sharing of data among all DoD facilities and provide information electronically to other Federal, state, local, and tribal agencies. DoD will make the information available to the public, whenever practicable and appropriate.
- DoD will enhance existing or, as appropriate, develop new site-specific study
  mechanisms to identify high risk populations or populations. As discussed earlier,
  DoD will revise and reissue DoD guidelines on implementing NEPA to ensure that
  environmental justice considerations are documented in the NEPA process.
- DoD installations will, through periodic updates to their installation master plans, assess how their operations and activities affect the communities located near DoD facilities.
- DoD installations will, prior to applying for a variance from any local environmental requirements, evaluate each request to determine if such a variance will have a disproportionately high or adverse human health and environmental effect on minority and low-income populations.
- DoD will review and revise as appropriate, all policy documents addressing procedures for the sale and disposal of surplus and off-specification DoD materials and supplies. The review will focus on the provision of safeguards (such as verification of buyer responsibility) to prevent such material from having disproportionately high and adverse human health and environmental effects on minority and low-income populations.

- DoD will administer environmental permitting, compliance, research, grant, and agreement programs to avoid, disproportionately high and adverse human health and environmental effects on minority and low-income populations.
- DoD will support efforts to develop and implement a coordinated strategy to conduct health research. Where appropriate, the DoD will include diverse segments of the population, such as minority and low-income populations and workers who may be exposed to substantial environmental hazards, in the development of research proposals. DoD will encourage the participation of these groups in the development of its research strategies. DoD also will review, as part of the development of integrated natural resource management plans, any risks associated with the consumption of fish and wildlife and other food gathered on DoD installations.
- DoD will integrate environmental justice training into education and outreach
  programs for appropriate DoD employees, including senior leaders. DoD will expand
  environmental and leadership training programs to ensure that DoD military
  personnel and civilian employees understand their obligation to address issues of
  environmental justice in their day-to-day activities.
- DoD will continue efforts to enhance diversity in the membership of Restoration Advisory Boards (RAB). Guidelines issued in August 1994 require that each RAB reflect the diversity of the communities in which RABs operate.
- DoD will improve existing outreach and communication systems to include environmental justice stakeholders. At a minimum, DoD installations will (1) provide translation of crucial public documents and conduct interpretation of hearings, (2) prepare documents using language that is non-technical, (3) ensure that document repositories are readily accessible to the public, (4) schedule meetings with the public at times and places that are convenient to members of the community, and (5) increase the use of community organizations and non-traditional news organizations that may be primary sources of information for minority and low-income populations.

#### PUBLIC PARTICIPATION AND OUTREACH PROCESSES

DoD recognizes that public involvement focuses on providing communities access to information on, and participation in, matters related to human health and the environment. To that end, DoD will continue to promote Restoration Advisory Boards (RAB) and Technical Review Committees (TRC) as forums for discussion about environmental cleanup activities at DoD. DoD also will develop new mechanisms to improve opportunities for minority and low-income populations to participate in decision-making processes that affect them. In addition, DoD will continue to promote public participation during the NEPA process to address potential human health and environmental effects from proposed major DoD actions, and public involvement in the development of integrated natural resource management plans. DoD will enhance existing mechanisms, such as the Legacy Resources Management Program, to encourage diverse stakeholder participation in DoD activities that affect human health and the environment.

#### MODEL PROJECTS AND PROGRAMS

- DoD has begun an initiative that will develop case studies of Army installations located in areas targeted for potential environmental justice concerns. Through the leadership of the Army, DoD will use existing data and programs and data collected by other sources, to analyze environmental justice impacts in the BRAC program, public participation in the cleanup program, and environmental analysis for the NEPA program. The initiative also will include the development of training opportunities and course material that can be broadened for inclusion into DoD's training programs.
- Under the *Joint Land Use Studies* program, DoD works with local communities to develop a plan for implementing land use recommendations around a military installation. The fundamental objective of the JLUS program is to protect community health, safety and welfare, and the military mission.
- DoD has recently embarked on a program to post multilingual signs warning of potential environmental hazards in areas adjacent to cleanup sites. The Navy has taken the lead in this project to communicate possible risks associated with consuming fish and wildlife on DoD property undergoing environmental cleanup.
- Restoration Advisory Boards (RABs) are the cornerstone of DoD efforts to expand community involvement in decisions about cleanup at military bases. By bringing together people who reflect the many diverse interests within the community, a RAB can help identify issues of concern and reduce potential communication problems that could result in needless delays. In addition to providing input on cleanup activities, each RAB acts as a liaison between the community and the base.
- DoD is examining a proposal to develop a comprehensive *Public Information and Outreach Strategic Guide* that will provide specific guidance on all aspects of public information. The guide will focus on enhancing existing mechanisms, as well as developing new mechanisms for communicating with stakeholders. One proposed element takes advantage of the "information superhighway" to facilitate the exchange of information.
- The *Legacy Resources Management Program* was created to assist DoD in balancing the use of its lands for military training and testing with the protection of natural and cultural resources. The Legacy Program supports projects that promote an understanding of, and an appreciation for, natural and cultural resources, as well as promotes partnerships with Native American tribal governments.

#### SECTION 2 STRATEGY ON ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE

#### **VISION**

DoD will integrate the President's policy on environmental justice into its mission by ensuring that its programs, policies, and activities with potential disproportionately high and adverse human health or environmental effects on minority and low-income populations are identified and addressed. Affected communities will be partners in the process to address these concerns; together, we will build a foundation that reflects an awareness and understanding of environmental justice issues. In addition, DoD will annually evaluate progress in implementing and maintaining compliance with the provisions of the Executive order.

#### **GOAL 1: IMPLEMENTATION**

Establish a decision-making infrastructure to implement the provisions of the Executive Order

IDENTIFY AN INTERNAL ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS FOR DEVELOPING THE STRATEGY

- Establish ODUSD(ES) as lead to staff strategy development and oversee implementation of the Executive Order (*Completed April 1994*).
- Establish a DoD-wide Committee on Environmental Justice under the Defense Environmental Security Council to coordinate and facilitate implementation of the Executive Order (*Completed May 1994*).
- Identify offices in each service branch that will execute the requirements and goals of the Executive Order. (*Completed May 1994*)
- Coordinate with agency General Counsel and the DoD Office of Equal Employment Opportunity to review legal implications of the Executive Order. (*Ongoing*)

ESTABLISH MECHANISMS FOR WORKING COOPERATIVELY WITH THE INTERAGENCY WORKING GROUP ON ENVIRONMENTAL JUSTICE (IWG)

- Select representatives from the DoD Committee on Environmental Justice to serve as members of the 10 Task Forces established to assist the IWG. (Completed May 1994)
- Select representative from the DoD Committee on Environmental Justice to co-chair the Outreach Task Force Committee of the IWG.(*Completed May 1994*)

## IDENTIFY AN INTERNAL ADMINISTRATIVE PROCESS FOR MONITORING AND EVALUATING PROGRESS TOWARD IMPLEMENTING THE STRATEGY

- Complete a survey of DoD activities, studies, databases, agreements, and other information that could assist DoD and the IWG in meeting the goals of the Executive Order. (*Completed June 1994*)
- Evaluate implementation progress on an annual basis, including the conduct of internal interviews and take all the steps necessary to monitor compliance with the Executive Order.
- Identify and develop a schedule for implementing several specific projects to address particular concerns identified during the development of the strategy.
- Establish an accountability system for identifying, tracking, and monitoring environmental justice activities.
- Integrate environmental justice training into education and outreach programs for appropriate DoD employees, including senior leaders.

## GOAL 2: HUMAN HEALTH AND ENVIRONMENTAL RESEARCH, DATA COLLECTION, AND ANALYSIS

Identify populations and communities that may be exposed to disproportionately high and adverse human health or environmental effects caused by activities under DoD's U.S. jurisdiction

- Establish a strategy to gather existing demographic data within appropriate geographic areas.
- Establish an information resource management strategy to maintain demographic data within appropriate geographic areas.
- Enhance existing, or as appropriate, develop new site specific study mechanisms to identify high risk populations or communities.

Identify and address, as appropriate, disproportionately high and adverse human health or environmental effects of DoD programs, policies and activities on minority and low-income populations at DoD U.S. sites and facilities

- Collect, maintain, and analyze information, whenever practicable and appropriate to assess and compare disproportionately high and adverse environmental and human health risks borne by populations identified by race, national origin, and income.
- Conduct, whenever practicable and appropriate, a systematic review of DoD U.S. programs, policies and activities to identify activities that may have a

- disproportionately high and adverse environmental or human health effect on minority and low-income populations.
- Assess DoD's methods for determining changes to existing or additions of new
  military operations and siting of facilities such a sanitary landfills and wastewater
  treatment plants.
- Identify opportunities to avoid or mitigate disproportionately high and adverse human health and environmental impacts on minority and low-income populations and identify and undertake new or existing model demonstration programs to reduce such effects.
- Ensure that DoD programs and actions involving environmental permitting, compliance, research, grants, and agreements, are administered so as to identify and address, where appropriate, disproportionately high and adverse human health or environmental effects of DoD U.S. activities on minority and low-income populations.

Ensure that DoD environmental and human health research, whenever practicable and appropriate, includes diverse segments of the population

- Evaluate current risk assessment methodologies as they relate to affected communities, including cumulative and multiple exposures and/or synergistic effects.
- Review, and revise accordingly, guidance for appropriate inclusion of high risk populations in DoD's health-related research.

Identify the patterns of consumption for, and communicate the health risks to, populations who principally rely on fish and/or wildlife for subsistence at DoD U.S. installations

- Assess the cumulative exposures affecting human health.
- Assess the cumulative risks related to consumption of fish and/or wildlife.

#### GOAL 3: PUBLIC PARTICIPATION AND OUTREACH

Improve opportunities for minority and low-income communities to participate in and have access to information on DoD policies and practices that affect human health and the environment

- Identify DoD stakeholder groups and their environmental justice concerns and interests.
- Encourage stakeholder participation in the implementation of the Executive order.

- Improve existing outreach and communication systems to include Environmental Justice stakeholders.
- Enhance existing, or as appropriate, develop new mechanisms to encourage stakeholder participation in DoD activities that affect human health and the environment.
- Provide translation of crucial public documents and conduct interpretation of hearings, where practicable and appropriate. Communication should be clear and concise to facilitate comprehension.

#### **GOAL 4: NONDISCRIMINATION-TITLE VI**

Foster nondiscrimination in DoD-funded programs or activities that substantially affect human health or the environment as required by Title VI of the Civil Rights Act

Review compliance with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act and develop adequate
oversight to determine that programs and activities receiving DoD financial
assistance that affect human health or the environment do not discriminate on the
basis of race, color, or national origin.

#### **GOAL 5: NATIONAL PERFORMANCE REVIEW**

Promote the principles set forth in the Report of the National Performance Review: From Red Tape to Results: Creating a Government That Works Better and Costs Less, in the planning, development, and implementation of the provisions of the Executive Order

- Identify opportunities for interagency data collection, studies, and projects that could be used to meet the goals of Executive Order 12898.
- Utilize the Defense Environmental Network and Information Exchange (DENIX) to share information with other Agencies.
- Cooperate and work with other Federal agencies in the government-wide implementation of Executive Order 12898, to ensure efficient use of information data systems and to avoid duplication and waste of federal resources.

#### SECTION 3 IMPLEMENTATION PLAN

#### INTRODUCTION

On February 11, 1994, President Clinton issued an Executive Order entitled *Federal Actions* to Address Environmental Justice in Minority Populations and Low-Income Populations. The measure requires Federal agencies to identify and address disproportionately high and adverse human health and environmental effects of Federal programs, policies, and activities on minority and low-income populations.

The preceding strategy identifies the major programs and areas of emphasis where the Department of Defense (DoD) believes it can best meet the intent of the Executive Order, minimize any adverse effects on the human health and environment of minority and low-income populations, and carry out the defense mission. This implementation plan outlines the specific steps DoD will take to execute this strategy.

DoD considers this plan to be a living document. It is designed to allow for change as DoD identifies new opportunities and initiatives and modifies or enhances existing or proposed initiatives. Aspects of the plan may change in response to new directions from the Administration and the Interagency Working Group on Environmental Justice (IWG) chaired by the Environmental Protection Agency (EPA). In addition, DoD plans to implement the Executive Order principally through its compliance with the provisions of the National Environmental Policy Act (NEPA). As such, elements of this plan may change based on changes in regulations for implementing NEPA.

This plan focuses on implementing institutional changes, rather than one-time projects, to ensure that a healthy and safe environment exists around activities that are located in or near minority and low-income populations. To that end, DoD will operate in accordance with the following principles:

- Promote partnerships with all stakeholders: DoD believes that establishing more meaningful dialogue with its stakeholders, particularly those at the state, local, and tribal level, will help it fulfill its environmental responsibilities and carry out its mission. DoD is doing this through greater community involvement with organizations such as Restoration Advisory Boards (RAB) that facilitate cleanup at military bases. Another example is the Legacy Resources Management Program which engages the community in projects that promote an understanding of, and an appreciation for, our nation's natural and cultural resources.
- Identify the impacts of DoD activities on minority and low-income populations: DoD will use the NEPA process to assess the effects proposed actions may have on minority and low-income populations. The NEPA requires DoD installations to collect and analyze data on the socioeconomic makeup of the populations that may be affected by proposed actions, as well as on any risks to human health or the environment posed by the proposed action.

- Streamline government: In keeping with the spirit of the National Performance
  Review to reinvent government rather than create additional layers of bureaucracy,
  DoD will rely on its existing processes and programs to implement the strategy. In
  addition, DoD will encourage increased cooperation between Federal agencies as key
  to reducing duplication and waste of Federal resources.
- Improve the day-to-day operations of installations: DoD believes that there are many opportunities in and around military installations where DoD can increase its public participation efforts. Using RABs (for cleanup activities) and other similar groups (for non-cleanup activities), DoD installations will actively involve populations in decisions about base operations which may affect the human health and environment of the local community. Installations will take affirmative steps to include members of minority and low-income populations in planning initiatives that affect these groups.
- Foster nondiscrimination in DoD programs: DoD recognizes that many existing laws, such as Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, provide opportunities to address environmental hazards in minority and low-income populations. DoD efforts in this area will focus on enforcement of basic provisions for non-discrimination in its programs.

The following discussion corresponds to the goals outlined in Section 2.

#### **GOAL 1: IMPLEMENTATION**

DoD understands the importance of infusing an ethic of environmental justice throughout its day-to-day operations and activities. To that end, DoD will integrate principles of environmental justice into its programs, policies, and activities. Coupled with its goal to develop a highly qualified and well-trained environmental work force, DoD sees education and training as the foundation for infusing this ethic into its environmental programs.

In the 12 months since the Executive Order was issued, DoD has undertaken and completed many actions to establish a decision-making infrastructure through which to implement provisions of the Executive Order:

• DoD identified the Office of the Deputy Under Secretary of Defense (Environmental Security) to lead the development of the strategy and to oversee implementation provisions of the Executive Order. DoD also established a DoD-wide Committee on Environmental Justice (CEJ) under the Defense Environmental Security Council to develop, help implement, and monitor DoD's environmental justice activities. The CEJ is made up of senior level staff who will guide the implementation of DoD's strategy on environmental justice. In addition, each of the DoD military departments and key defense agencies has identified an office that will execute the requirements and goals of the Executive Order within its department.

- The CEJ actively worked with the DoD General Counsel and the DoD Office of Equal Employment Opportunity to ensure that the strategy incorporated the legal requirements of the Executive Order.
- DoD established mechanisms for working with the IWG and actively participated on the task force committees established to assist the IWG in implementing the provisions of the Executive Order. DoD co-chairs the IWG Task Force Committee on Outreach.
- DoD participated in the first interagency Public Meeting on Environmental Justice held in Atlanta, Georgia, on January 20, 1995.

DoD will continue to build a foundation to support the integration of environmental justice into its programs, policies, and activities. It will continue the CEJ as a formal forum for guiding the implementation process. DoD will expand environmental and leadership training programs to ensure that DoD military personnel and civilian employees understand their obligation to address issues of environmental justice in their day-to-day activities.

#### **Key actions:**

DoD will evaluate its progress toward implementing the Executive Order on an annual basis. Using the framework of the *Defense Environmental Quality Annual Report to Congress* to collect information and report progress, DoD will conduct internal reviews and take the steps necessary to monitor compliance with the Executive Order. The environmental quality report describes the achievements and initiatives in DoD's environmental quality programs for pollution prevention, conservation, technology, and education and training. The report is published in early spring each year and was developed to fulfill the requirements outlined in Executive Order 12856 and 10 U.S.C. Section 2706(b).

DoD will establish an accountability system for identifying and monitoring environmental justice activities. In general, accountability will be overseen through the environmental compliance review process discussed above. Specifically, DoD will identify military departments and key defense agencies that are leading or will lead the development and implementation of model projects and programs contained in the implementation plan. Each department or agency will hold periodic reviews to assess progress and share lessons learned. As part of their self-audits, DoD military departments, defense agencies, and defense field activities will conduct a review of installation operations, activities, and land use to determine whether disproportionately high and adverse human health and environmental effects on minority and low-income populations living near the installation have been addressed.

DoD will integrate environmental justice training into education and outreach programs for appropriate DoD employees, including senior leaders. To that end, DoD will develop a curriculum outline about environmental justice for incorporation into all DoD environmental training programs and appropriate DoD senior leadership courses. To ensure consistency in training between the various military departments and defense agencies, DoD will use the Inter-Service Environmental Education Review Board (ISEERB) which was established in

1994 to integrate disparate DoD environmental education and training programs into a single school system that eliminates duplication and improves the quality of courses. To further expand awareness of environmental justice, DoD will create and disseminate to its military personnel and civilian employees a video that discusses issues of environmental justice and communicates DoD policy on environmental justice.

## GOAL 2: HUMAN HEALTH AND ENVIRONMENTAL DATA COLLECTION, ANALYSIS, AND RESEARCH

DoD recognizes that a consistent and fully integrated approach to data management is key to assessing the impacts of its operations on local populations. To that end, DoD will use NEPA as the primary mechanism to implement the provisions of the Executive Order. When appropriate, environmental assessments, environmental impact statements, and records of decision will evaluate the potential environmental effects (including human health, economic, and social) of its actions on minority and low-income populations. To streamline government and eliminate duplication, DoD will coordinate with other Federal agencies to improve the data collection and research needed to support environmental analysis. To support that effort, DoD strongly encourages the effective use of existing databases and, if necessary, the development of new national databases.

DoD has identified three areas in which to address issues related to data collection, analysis, and research: (1) identifying minority and low-income populations that may be affected by DoD programs, (2) identifying and addressing programs that may affect minority and low-income populations, and (3) ensuring that environmental research reflects the diversity of populations. **IDENTIFY POPULATIONS AND** POPULATIONS THAT MAY BE EXPOSED TO DISPROPORTIONATELY HIGH AND ADVERSE HUMAN HEALTH AND ENVIRONMENTAL EFFECTS CAUSED BY ACTIVITIES UNDER DOD'S U.S. JURISDICTION

Key to the NEPA process will be the identification of minority and low-income populations. DoD installations will strengthen the community relations plan (CRP) as a tool to understand the

# MODEL PROJECTS/PROGRAMS ENVIRONMENTAL EQUITY PROJECT

The Department of Defense (DoD) has begun an initiative that will develop case studies of Army installations located in areas targeted for potential environmental justice concerns. Through the leadership of the Army, DoD will use existing data and programs, such as the Army's Economic Impact Forecast System and EPA databases, to provide a basis for analysis of environmental justice issues. The project also will examine data collected by other sources, including historically black colleges. The Army will use the data to analyze environmental justice impacts in the BRAC program, public participation in the cleanup program, and environmental analysis for NEPA. The initiative also will include the development of training opportunities and course material that can be broadened for inclusion into DoD's training program.

socioeconomic makeup of the populations in and around their operations. Installations will combine data gathered from interviews with members of the local community with data

gathered from the U.S. Bureau of the Census and various databases maintained by the military departments, defense agencies, and other agencies such as the EPA and local and tribal governments. Where this information does not exist, DoD will coordinate with other Federal, state, local, and tribal governments to develop the information.

At a minimum, DoD military departments, defense agencies, and defense field activities will determine whether proposed actions will affect the environment and human health of minority and low-income populations. For those installations for which a potential impact has been identified, DoD proponents will develop data for any proposed major action that is subject to the provisions of NEPA or to the reporting requirements under the Emergency Planning and Community Right-To-Know Act.

#### **Key actions:**

- DoD military departments, defense agencies, and defense field activities will coordinate with other Federal agencies and state, local, and tribal governments to compile or develop demographic and socioeconomic data with respect to race, national origin, income level, and other appropriate information, as necessary. DoD proponents will use this information to assess whether any proposed action may have disproportionately high and adverse human health and environmental effects on minority or low-income populations. To the extent practicable, DoD will undertake these assessments during the NEPA or community planning processes.
- DoD will continue to maintain its data exchange and information network, known as the Defense Environmental Network Information Exchange (DENIX), to encourage sharing of data among all DoD facilities and provide information electronically to other Federal, state, local, and tribal agencies. DoD will make the information available to the public, whenever practicable and appropriate.
- DoD will enhance existing or, as appropriate, develop new site-specific study
  mechanisms to identify high risk populations or populations. As discussed earlier,
  DoD will revise and reissue DoD guidelines on implementing NEPA to ensure that
  environmental justice considerations are documented in the NEPA process.

IDENTIFY AND ADDRESS, AS APPROPRIATE, DOD PROGRAMS, POLICIES AND ACTIVITIES THAT MAY HAVE DISPROPORTIONATELY HIGH AND ADVERSE HUMAN HEALTH AND ENVIRONMENTAL EFFECTS ON MINORITY AND LOW-INCOME POPULATIONS AT DOD U.S. SITES AND FACILITIES.

DoD's primary means for addressing any disproportionately high and adverse human health and environmental effects on minority and low-income populations at DoD sites and facilities will be implemented in connection with the NEPA process. All major federal actions are subject to the NEPA process which involves assessing any potential effects to the physical and human environment. In documents prepared under NEPA, DoD will discuss the impacts of its proposed actions on minority and low-income populations.

Another means for addressing environmental justice concerns is through the master plans prepared by each installation. In preparing the master plans, DoD installations will assess how their operations and activities affect the communities located near DoD installations. During periodic updates to the master plans, the installations will evaluate whether there are any adverse impacts of its operations or activities on any minority or low-income populations with respect to human health and the physical environment.

#### **Key actions:**

- In the development of NEPA documents or installation master plans, DoD military departments, defense agencies, and defense field activities will collect, maintain, and analyze information for assessing whether these activities or proposed actions have disproportionately high and adverse environmental and human health effects on minority or low-income populations. For example, DoD military departments, defense agencies, and defense field activities will use the NEPA process when determining changes to existing, or additions of, new military operations and the siting of facilities such as sanitary landfills and
  - sanitary landfills and wastewater treatment plants.
- DoD military departments, defense agencies, and defense field activities also will identify opportunities to avoid or mitigate disproportionately high and adverse human health and environmental impacts on minority and lowincome populations and identify and undertake new or existing model demonstration programs to reduce such effects. For example, installations will, prior to applying for a variance from any local environmental requirements, evaluate each

#### MODEL PROJECTS/PROGRAMS

# JOINT LAND USE STUDIES PROGRAM (JLUS)

Under the JLUS program, DoD works with local populations to develop a plan for implementing recommendations for land use around a military installation. The fundamental objective of the JLUS is to protect community health, safety and welfare, and the military mission.

Public involvement is an essential part of this process. The JLUS program was developed in 1985 to provide technical and financial incentives for local communities to help resolve potential conflicts between DoD mission objectives and community growth patterns.

request to determine if such a variance will have a disproportionately high or adverse human health and environmental effect on minority and low-income populations. Similarly, DoD will review and revise as appropriate, all policy documents addressing procedures for the sale and disposal of surplus and off-specification DoD materials and supplies. The review will focus on the provision of safeguards (such as verification of buyer responsibility) to prevent such material from having disproportionately high and adverse human health and environmental effects on minority and low-income populations.

DoD military departments, defense agencies, and defense field activities involved
with environmental permitting, compliance, research, grants, and agreements, will
identify and address, where appropriate, disproportionately high and adverse human
health and environmental effects of these actions on minority and low-income
populations. The DoD proponent will administer environmental permitting and
compliance programs to avoid, whenever practicable and appropriate,
disproportionately high and adverse human health and environmental effects on
minority and low-income populations.

ENSURE THAT DOD ENVIRONMENTAL AND HUMAN HEALTH RESEARCH, WHENEVER PRACTICABLE AND APPROPRIATE, INCLUDES DIVERSE SEGMENTS OF THE POPULATION AT HIGH RISK FROM ENVIRONMENTAL HAZARDS, SUCH AS MINORITY POPULATIONS, LOW-INCOME POPULATIONS, AND WORKERS WHO MAY BE EXPOSED TO SUBSTANTIAL ENVIRONMENTAL HAZARDS.

DoD's principal proponents for conducting environmental and human health research are: (1) the Office of the Assistant Director of Defense, Research, and Engineering, which is responsible for coordinating research and development programs DoD-wide; (2) the Office of the Assistant Secretary of Defense for Health Affairs, which is responsible for DoD health policies, programs, and activities; and (3) the counterpart agencies within the Military Departments, including the Army Center for Health Promotion and Preventive Medicine, Navy Environmental Health Center, and the Air Force Office of the Surgeon General. In addition, DoD works with the Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry (ATSDR) under a cooperative agreement to determine the risks to human health and the physical environment that might arise from DoD activities.

DoD recognizes that health research provides an opportunity for Federal, state, local, and tribal governments to work together to eliminate duplication and reduce costs. DoD will support efforts to develop and implement a coordinated strategy on health research. Where appropriate, the DoD proponents identified above will include diverse segments of the population, such as minority and low-income populations and workers who may be exposed to substantial environmental hazards, in the development of research proposals. DoD will encourage the participation of these groups in the development of its research strategies. DoD also will review, as part of the development of integrated natural resource management

### MODEL PROJECTS/PROGRAMS

#### **ENVIRONMENTAL WARNING SIGNS**

The Department of Defense has recently embarked on a program to post multi-lingual signs warning of potential environmental hazards in areas adjacent to cleanup sites. The Navy has taken the lead in this project to communicate possible risks of consuming fish and wildlife on property undergoing environmental cleanup. One program posts signs along the shoreline of Hunters Point Naval Shipyard in San Francisco, CA, in four languages: English, Spanish, Vietnamese, and Chinese. Specifically the signs warn against the consumption of shellfish taken from the waters in the area, as well as warn against potential environmental hazards in the area.

plans, the risks associated with the consumption of fish, wildlife, and other food gathered on DoD installations.

#### **Key actions:**

- DoD health research proponents will evaluate current risk assessment methodologies as they relate to affected populations, including cumulative and multiple exposures and/or synergistic effects.
- DoD health research proponents will develop guidance to include high risk populations in DoD's health-related research.
- For DoD installations and activities located in areas where populations rely on fish and or wildlife for subsistence, the respective proponents will:
- ⇒Consider, during the NEPA process or the development of integrated natural resource management plans, the cumulative exposures and risks related to different patterns of consumption of fish and/or wildlife and the impact of DoD operations on fish and/or wildlife.
- ⇒Communicate to affected populations the risks associated with differential patterns of consumption of fish and/or wildlife. DoD will broaden efforts to post environmental warning signs in English, as well as in other languages appropriate for the community in which the signs will be posted.

#### GOAL 3: PUBLIC PARTICIPATION AND OUTREACH

DoD recognizes that public involvement focuses on providing communities access to information on, and participation in, matters related to human health and the environment. To that end, DoD will continue to promote Restoration Advisory Boards (RAB) and Technical Review Committees (TRC) as forums for discussion about environmental cleanup activities at DoD installations. RABs are a recent addition to DoD's efforts to provide opportunities for communities to provide input into cleanup activities at military installations. Guidelines issued in August 1994 require that each RAB reflect the diversity of the communities in which RABs operate.

DoD also will develop new mechanisms to improve opportunities for minority and low-income populations to participate in decision-making processes that affect them. In addition, DoD will continue to promote public participation during the NEPA process to address potential human health and environmental effects that may result from proposed major DoD actions. DoD will encourage public involvement in the development of integrated natural resource management plans.

DoD will enhance existing mechanisms, such as the Legacy Resources Management

# MODEL PROJECTS/PROGRAMS RESTORATION ADVISORY BOARDS (RAB)

RABs are the cornerstone of DoD efforts to expand community involvement in decisions about cleanup at military bases. By bringing together people who reflect the many diverse interests within the community, a RAB can help identify issues of concern and reduce potential communication problems that could result in needless delays. In addition to providing input on cleanup activities, each RAB acts as a liaison between the community and the base.

Program, to encourage diverse stakeholder participation in DoD activities that affect human health and the environment. The Legacy program, of which public awareness and education is a major component, promotes an understanding of, and access to, significant natural, cultural, and historical resources.

#### **Key actions:**

- DoD will identify DoD stakeholder groups and their environmental justice concerns and interests. For example, for those DoD installations for which a community relations plan (CRP) is required, each installation will strengthen its plan by identifying all stakeholders, particularly minority and low-income populations.
- DoD will enhance existing or, as appropriate, develop new mechanisms to encourage stakeholder participation in DoD activities that affect human health and the environment. DoD will continue to encourage stakeholder participation in RABs and similar groups.

#### MODEL PROJECTS/PROGRAMS

# COMPREHENSIVE PUBLIC INFORMATION AND OUTREACH STRATEGIC GUIDE (Proposed)

The Department of Defense is examining a proposal to develop a comprehensive Public Information and Outreach Strategic Guide that will provide specific guidance on all aspects of public information. The guide, to be developed primarily for use by DoD installations, will focus on enhancing existing mechanisms to encourage stakeholder participation but also includes the development of new mechanisms to broaden communication to all stakeholders.

One element of the proposed strategy takes advantage of the "information superhigh-way" to seek input from, and keep stakeholders informed of, DoD activities. Other elements include the:

- Design and creation of an on-line network linking DoD and such environmental justice stakeholders as historically black colleges and universities and Native American colleges
- Design and development of an "on demand telefax" capability to provide virtual realtime telefaxed responses to stakeholders
- DoD will improve existing outreach and communication systems to include environmental justice stakeholders. At a minimum, DoD will provide translation of crucial public documents and conduct interpretation of hearings, where practicable and appropriate. Documents will be written for the target audience. Each should be clear and concise, using language that is non-technical and illustrative to facilitate comprehension. DoD installations will ensure that document repositories are readily accessible to the public and schedule meetings with the public at times and places that are convenient to members of the community. In addition, installations will increase their use of community organizations and non-traditional news organizations that may be primary sources of information for minority and lowincome populations. These expanded outreach efforts will include churches, community centers, tribal governments, schools, and other organizations that serve minority and low-income populations.

#### **GOAL 4: NONDISCRIMINATION-(TITLE VI)**

Existing environmental and civil rights statutes provide opportunities to address environmental hazards in minority and low-income populations. DoD recognizes that application of existing statutory provisions is an important part of its efforts to ensure that its programs, policies, and activities do not have the effect of excluding persons from

participating in, denying persons the benefits of, or subjecting persons to discrimination under such programs because of their race, color, or national origin. In accordance with DoD Directive 5500.1, *Nondiscrimination in Federally Assisted Programs*, DoD will foster nondiscrimination in its programs or activities that substantially affect human health or the environment.

#### **Key action:**

origin.

• Review compliance with Title VI of the Civil Rights Act to confirm that programs and activities receiving DoD financial assistance that affect human health or the environment do not discriminate on the basis of race, color, or national

## GOAL 5: NATIONAL PERFORMANCE REVIEW

The National Performance Review (NPR) was an intensive six-month study of the Federal government conducted in 1993 that had as its goal: moving from red tape to results to create a government that works better and costs less. A key element of the recommendations of the NPR focuses on Federal agencies working in cooperation to provide consistent direction and avoid

#### MODEL PROJECTS/PROGRAMS

#### LEGACY RESOURCES MANAGEMENT PROGRAM

The Legacy Program was created in November 1990 to assist DoD in balancing the intensive use of its lands for military training and testing with the protection of natural and cultural resources. The Legacy Program supports projects that promote an under-standing of, and an appreciation for, natural and cultural resources, as well as promote partnerships with Native American tribal governments.

duplication and waste of Federal resources. To that end, DoD will identify opportunities where it can work with other Federal agencies to collect data, conduct studies, and implement projects that can be used to meet the goals of the Executive Order. DoD will promote the principles set forth in the *Report of the National Performance Review: From Red Tape to Results: Creating a Government That Works Better and Costs Less*, in the planning, development, and implementation of the provisions of the Executive Order.

#### **Key actions:**

- Identify opportunities for interagency data collection, studies, and projects that could be used to meet the goals of the Executive Order.
- Expand and broaden access to the Defense Environmental Network and Information Exchange (DENIX) to encourage sharing of information with other agencies.
- Cooperate and work with other Federal agencies in the government-wide implementation of Executive Order, to ensure efficient use of information data systems and to avoid duplication and waste of Federal resources.

#### ATTACHMENT A

#### E.O. 12898 of February 11, 1994 and accompanying Presidential Memorandum

#### ATTACHMENT B

#### LIST OF ACRONYMS

ATSDR Agency for Toxic Substances and Disease Registry

CEJ Committee on Environmental Justice

**CRP** Community Relations Plan

DENIX Defense Environmental Network and Information Exchange

DoD Department of Defense

E.O. Executive Order

**EPA Environmental Protection Agency** 

ISEERB Inter-Service Environmental Education Review Board

IWG Interagency Working Group on Environmental Justice

JLUS Joint Land Use Studies Program

NEPA National Environmental Policy Act

NPR National Performance Review

ODUSD(ES) Office of the Deputy Under Secretary of Defense (Environmental Security)

RAB Restoration Advisory Board

TRC Technical Review Committee