Environment & Security in an International Context

Editors

Kurt M. Lietzmann, Germany Pilot Study Co-Director

Gary D. Vest, United States of America
Pilot Study Co-Director

Final Report March 1999

Report No. 232

Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety United States of America Department of Defense Committee on the Challenges of Modern Society







North
Atlantic
Treaty
Organisation

The contents of this Pilot Study Summary Report are the result of a consensus based collaborative research process undertaken under the auspices of the NATO Committee on the Challenges of Modern Society. Final responsibility for the Report and the Pilot Study rests with its co-chairs. The findings and views enumerated in this report are those of the participants and contributors. They do not necessarily represent the views of the national governments who participated in the study.

ISBN 3-00-004383-7

Die Deutsche Bibliothek - CIP-Einheitsaufnahme

Environment & security in an international context:

final report March 1999 $\!\!\!/$ Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety, Bonn ...

Ed. Kurt M. Lietzmann; Gary D. Vest -

Bonn: Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety;

Washington: U.S.A., Dept. of Defense;

Bruxelles: Committee on the Challenges of Modern Society, 1999

(Report / North Atlantic Treaty Organisation,

Committee on the Challenges of Modern Society; No. 232)

ISBN 3-00-004383-7

Printed in Germany

Design: Helge Windisch, Cologne; www.flaneur.de

Print: Rotadruck Armin Weichert, Berlin

Translation: Anne-Gabrielle Mazurek (Rapport de Synthèse), Kerstin Imbusch, Andreas March (Zusammenfassender Bericht)

Project management: Alexander Carius

Pilot Study Directors

Kurt M. Lietzmann, Head of Unit, Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety, **Federal Republic of Germany**

Gary D. Vest, Principal Assistant, Deputy Under Secretary of Defense (Environmental Security), Department of Defense, **USA**

Pilot Study Subgroup Co-Chairs

Ambassador Bérengère Quincy, French Permanent Representative to the United Nations, **France** (formerly representing the French Secretariat General for National Defence - SGDN)

Professor Dr. Bedrich Moldan, Director, Environmental Center, Charles University, Prague, Czech Republic

Ambassador Dr. Irene Freudenschuß-Reichl, Austrian Permanent Representative to the United Nations, Vienna (formerly representing the Federal Ministry for the Environment, Youth, and Family Affairs), **Republic of Austria**

Pilot Study Consultants

Ecologic, Centre for International and European Environmental Research, Germany,

Alexander Carius, Kerstin Imbusch, Eileen Petzold-Bradley, Dr. Sebastian Oberthür with the assistance of Matthias Paustian, Andreas March, Elvira Rinke, Neeta Sharma-Höfelein

Evidence Based Research, USA, Brian Smith, Laurie MacNamara, Lisa Witzig Davidson

Center for Negotiation Analysis, USA, Dr. Bertram I. Spector

The NATO CCMS

The aim of CCMS, created in 1969, is to tackle challenges of modern society, particularly problems affecting the environment of the nations and the quality of life of their peoples, taking advantage of the potential for co-operation offered by the Alliance. In order to foster confidence and stability the CCMS was established to give the civil dimension of security an institutional framework through co-operation in civil research projects and dialogue.

Two important concepts characterise the work of the Committee, namely that it shall consider specific problems of the human environment with the deliberate objective of stimulating action by member governments and that its final results should be entirely open and accessible to international organisations or individual countries elsewhere in the world.

The Committee provides a unique forum for the sharing of knowledge and experience on technical, scientific and policy aspects of social and environmental matters both in the civilian and military sectors among NATO and EAPC Partner countries. The work of the Committee is carried out on a decentralised basis and participation by nations to the pilot studies, projects, workshops and seminars, which are nationally funded, is voluntary. The NATO Civil Budget provides financial assistance for CCMS to award grants to enable experts to participate in CCMS activities.

Environment and Security in an International Context
wledgements
We are grateful for the financial contributions provided by the various ministries and departments listed below that made it possible to publish this report.
Finish Ministry of Foreign Affairs
German Federal Ministry for the Environment, Nature Conservation and Nuclear Safety
Swedish Ministry for Foreign Affairs
Swiss Federal Department of Defence Civil Protection and Sports

Swiss Federal Department of Defence, Civil Protection and Sports United States Department of Defense

Table of Contents

	— page
List of Tables and Figures	Х
List of Abbreviations	XI
Full List of Contributors, Participants and Peer reviewers	XII
Executive Summary Report	1
Rapport de Synthèse	27
Zusammenfassender Bericht	57
Pilot Study Report	83
Bibliography	168

Table of Contents

Executive Summary Report

Preface	1
Introduction	3
Overview of Environment and Security	3
Origins and Working Programme of the Pilot Study	4
Importance of the Pilot Study	7
	0
Pilot Study Findings	8
Chapter 1: NATO Security Context	9
Chapter 2: Assessing the Links between Environment and Security	11
Chapter 3: Typology of Environmental Conflict Cases	16
Chapter 4: Integrated Risk Assessment	18
Chapter 5: Indicators, Data, and Decision Support Systems	21
Chapter 6: Policy Responses	23
Environmental Policy Key Findings	23
Development Policy Key Findings	24
Foreign and Security Policy Key Findings	25
Rapport de synthèse	
Préface	27
Introduction	29
Vue d'ensemble sur l'environnement et la sécurité	29
Origine et programme de travail de l'étude pilote	31
L'importance de l'étude pilote	
Conclusions de l'étude pilote	35
Chapitre 1: Le Contexte de sécurité de l'OTAN	36
Chapitre 2: Evaluation des liens entre environnement et sécurité	38
Chapitre 3: Typologie des conflits environnementaux	44
Chapitre 4: Evaluation intégrée du risque	46
Chapitre 5: Indicateurs, base de données et systèmes d'aide à la prise de décision	49
Chapitre 6: Réponses politiques	51
Conclusions clés en matière de politique environnementale	51
Conclusions clés en matière de politique de développement	53
Conclusions clés en matière de politique étrangère et de sécurité	54

Zusammenfassender Bericht

vorwor	ort			
Einleitu	ung			
Überbli	perblick über Umwelt und Sicherheit			
Ursprün	nge und Arbeitsprogramm der Pilotstudie	58		
Bedeuti	ung der Studie	62		
Pilotstu	udien-Ergebnisse	63		
Kapitel	1: NATO Sicherheitskontext	64		
Kapitel	2: Analyse der Beziehungen zwischen Umwelt und Sicherheit	67		
Kapitel	3: Typologie von Umweltkonfliktfällen	72		
Kapitel	4: Integrierte Risikoabschätzung	74		
Kapitel	5: Indikatoren, Daten und Entscheidungssysteme	77		
Kapitel	6: Politische Maßnahmen	79		
Um	weltpolitische Ergebnisse	79		
Ent	wicklungspolitische Ergebnisse	80		
Auß	Ben- und sicherheitspolitische Ergebnisse	81		
Pilot	t Study Report			
1	NATO Security Context	83		
1.1	Introduction	84		
1.2	Overview of the North Atlantic Alliance	84		
1.3	Civil Dimension - CCMS	85		
1.4	NATO and the New Security Context	86		
	1.4.1 The Strategic Concept of 1991	86		
	1.4.2 Relationships With Other Actors	88		
1.5	Future Challenges	88		
1.6	Capacities of the Alliance to Face the New Challenges	89		
1.7	Conclusions	92		
2	Assessing the Links between Environment and Security	93		
2.1	Introduction	94		
2.2	Clarifying the Concepts	96		
	2.2.1 Environmental Stress	96		
	2.2.2 Security	97		

2.3	3 Links between Environmental Stress and Conflict		
	2.3.1	Multi-causality	99
	2.3.2	Reciprocity/feedback loops	100
	2.3.3	Consequences of Environmental Stress	101
2.4	Contex	tual Factors	102
	2.4.1	Patterns of Perception	104
	2.4.2	Economic Vulnerability and Resource Dependency	105
	2.4.3	Institutional, Socio-economic and Technological Capacity	105
	2.4.4	Cultural and Ethno-political Factors	106
	2.4.5	Violence Potential and Internal Security Structures	106
	2.4.6	Political Stability	106
	2.4.7	Participation	107
	2.4.8	International Interaction	107
	2.4.9	Mechanisms of Conflict Resolution	107
3	Typolo	ogy of Environmental Conflict Cases	109
3.1	Introdu	action	109
3.2	Genera	l Characteristics of Environmental Conflicts	110
3.3	Types o	of Environmental Conflicts	111
	3.3.1	Ethno-political Conflicts	111
	3.3.2	Migration Conflicts	113
	3.3.3	Demographically Caused Migration Conflicts	115
	3.3.4	International Resource Conflicts	117
	3.3.5	Environmental Conflicts due to Global Environmental Change	119
4	Integr	ated Risk Assessment	121
4.1	Introdu	action	121
4.2	Method	dology	122
	4.2.1	Non-Linearity and Complex Adaptive Systems	122
	4.2.2	Assessing the Incidence of Environmental Stress	122
	4.2.3	Determining the Consequences of Environmental Stress	123
	4.2.4	Assessing the Potential Incidence or Escalation of Conflict	123
4.3	The Syndrome Approach		
4.4	Requirement for an Integrated Risk Assessment		

5	Indica	tors, Data, and Decision Support Systems	129
5.1	Introdu	iction	130
5.2	Indicat	ors	130
	5.2.1	Research and Modelling Projects on Environment and Conflict	130
	5.2.2	Sustainable Development Indicators	135
	5.2.3	Situational Contingency Indicators	138
5.3	Data a	nd Data Bases	140
5.4	Decisio	on Support Systems	142
6	Policy	Responses	144
6.1	Introdu	iction	148
	6.1.1	Principle of Sustainable Development	149
	6.1.2	Principles of Precaution, Integration and Co-operation	149
6.2	Enviror	nmental Policy Responses	150
	6.2.1	General Principles	150
	6.2.2	Responses	151
	6.2.3	International and Regional Environmental Agreements	153
	6.2.4	Develop Decision-Making in International Institutions	155
	6.2.5	Strengthen the Relevant International Institutional Framework	156
6.3	Develo	pment Policy Responses	157
	6.3.1	General Principles	157
	6.3.2	Responses	158
	6.3.3	Conclusion	162
6.4	Foreign and Security Policy Responses		163
	6.4.1	General Principles	163
	6.4.2	Responses	164
	613	Dispute Settlement and Conflict Management	166

List of Tables and Figures

		page
Executive Sur	nmary Report	
Figure 2.1 Figure 2.2 Figure 2.3 Table 4.1	Environmental Stress Conflict Dynamic Conceptual Model: Relationship between Environmental Change and Security Overview of Global Change	12 13 14 20
Rapport de S	ynthèse	
Figure 2.1 Figure 2.2 Figure 2.3 Table 4.1	Pressions environnementales Dynamique Conflictuelle Model Conceptuel: Relation entre Changement Environnemental et Sécurité Vue d'ensemble des syndromes du changement global	39 40 41 48
Zusammenfa	ssender Bericht	
Grafik 2.1 Grafik 2.2 Grafik 2.3 Tabelle 4.1	Umweltstreß Konfliktdynamik Konzeptuelles Modell Übersicht über die Syndrome des globalen Wandels	68 69 70 76
Pilot Study Ro	eport	
Figure 1.1 Figure 1.2 Figure 2.1	European Security and Defence Identity Framework OSCE-Membership Original Hypothesis	90 91 95
Figure 2.2 Figure 2.3 Figure 2.4	Operational Hypothesis Environmental Stress Conflict Dynamic	96 97 98
Figure 2.5 Figure 2.6	Consequences of Environmental Stress Relationship of the Consequences of Environmental Stress to the Potential Incidence or Escalation of Conflict	100 102
Figure 2.7	Contextual Factors that Enhance or Inhibit the Impact of the Consequences of Environmental Stress	103
Figure 2.8 Table 3.1 Table 3.2 Table 3.3 Table 3.4	Conceptual Model: Relationship between Environmental Change and Security Examples of Ethno-Political Conflicts Examples of Migration Conflicts Demographically Caused Migration Conflicts Examples of International Resource Conflicts	104 112 115 116 118
Table 4.1 Table 5.1 Table 5.2 Table 5.3	Overview of Global Change Syndromes Several Indicators Suggested in Goodrich and Brecke 1996 Several Indicators Suggested by Homer-Dixon and Percival 1996 Several Indicators Suggested by Baechler, et al. 1996	124 131 132 133
Table 5.3 Table 5.4 Table 5.5 Figure 5.1	Several Indicators Suggested by Baechler, et al. 1996 (continued) Working List of Indicators of Sustainable Development (abriged from United Nations, 1996) Several Sustainable Development Indicators and their Reference Values Test Case: Illustrative Marker Variables of Water Security	134 136 137 139
Table 5.6 Table 5.7 Figure 6.1	Examples of Global Environmental and Political-Social-Economic Data Bases Security Profiling Checklist Conceptual Model: Relationship Between Environmental Change and Security	141 143 148

List of Abbreviations

AAAS American Academy of Arts and Sciences

AAAS American Association for the Advancement of Science

CBD Convention on Biological Diversity
CCD Convention to Combat Desertification

CCMS Committee on the Challenges of Modern Society

CIESN Consortium for International Earth Sciences Information Network

CJTF Combined Joint Task Force

CSD Commission on Sustainable Development

DSS Decision Support Systems

EAPC Euro-Atlantic Partnership Council
EEA Europe Environmental Agency
EIA Environmental Impact Assessment
ENCOP Environmental Conflicts Project

EU European Union

FCCC United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change

GEF Global Environmental Facility

GEHS Global Environmental Change and Human Security Project

GEMS Global Environment Monitoring System
GRID Global Resources Information Database

ICPSR Inter-University Consortium for Political and Social Research

IFOR Implementation Force
IMF International Monetary Fund

IPCC Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change

NATO North Atlantic Treaty Organisation

NAC North Atlantic Council

NACC North Atlantic Co-operation Council NGO Non-Governmental Organisation

NIS New Independent States

ODA Official Development Assistance

OECD Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development
OSCE Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe

PfP Partnership for Peace

PRIO International Peace Research Institute
REC Regional Environmental Centre

UN United Nations

UNDP United Nations Development Programme
UNECE United Nations Economic Commission for Europe
UNEP United Nations Environmental Programme

UNCED United Nations Conference on Environment and Development

UNFAO United Nations Food and Agriculture Organisation
UNHCR United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees

WEU Western European Union
WRI World Resources Institute
WTO World Trade Organisation

Full List of Contributors, Participants and Peer reviewers

(in alphabetical order)

Eva Affolter Svenonius, Swiss Agency for the Environment, Forests and Landscape, Switzerland

Dr. Gunnar Arbman, National Defence Research Establishment, Sweden

Carl-Johan Asberg, Department of Peace and Conflict Research, Uppsala University, Sweden

Dr. Günther Baechler, Swiss Peace Foundation, Switzerland

Prof. Dr. Bagís, Middle East Technical University, Turkey

Prof. Dr. Lennart Bengsson, Max-Planck-Institute, Germany

Dr. Peter Billing, European Commission, Belgium

Dr. Frank Biermann, German Advisory Council on Global Change (WBGU), Germany

Dr. Mieczyslaw Borysiewicz, Institute for Environmental Protection, UN/ECE Regional Co-ordinating Centre for Industrial Accidents, Training and Exercises, Poland

Dr. Branko Bosnjakovic, UN Economic Commission for Europe, Switzerland

K. Bühler, Vienna Institute for International Law, Austria

Prof. Dr. Kent Hughes Butts, US Army War College, USA

Elizabeth Cambell, Department of Energy (DOE), USA

Dr. Capt. Mesut Hakki Casin, Turkish General Staff, Turkey

Dr. Steve Colson, Pacific Northwest National Laboratory (PNNL), USA

Anthony T. Downs, Department of National Defence, Canada

Prof. David Freestone, World Bank, Washington DC, USA

Dr. Nils Petter Gleditsch, International Peace Research Institute (PRIO), Norway

Sherri Goodman, US Department of Defense (DOD), USA

Nestor Gounaris, NATO/CCMS Fellow, USA

Dr. Marten Hajer, University of Munich, Germany

Lt. Cmdr. Fikret Hakgüden, Turkish General Staff, Turkey

Alan Hecht, US Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), USA

Sabine Hoefnagel, United Nations Environment Programme (UNEP), Switzerland

Dr. Manfred Kern, Hoechst Schering AgrEvo GmbH, Germany

Dr. Jürgen Krombach, Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit (GTZ), Germany

Donald Krug, Sea Fisheries Institute, Poland

Amaya Bloch-Lainé, Centre de recherches et d'études sur les stratégiques et les technologies (CREST), France

Prof. Dr. Gerhard Loibl, Federal Ministry for the Environment, Youth, and Family Affairs, Austria

Dr. Steve Lonergan, University of Victoria, Canada

Jonathan Margolis, US Department of State, USA

Dr. Bruno Messerli, Institute of Geography, Switzerland

Larry G. Morgan, Pacific Northwest National Laboratory (PNNL), USA

Prof. Dr. Namik Kemal Pak, The Scientific and Technical Research Council of Turkey (TÜBITAK)

Bent Anker Nielsen, Ministry of Environment and Energy, Denmark

Michael Odevall, Ministry for Foreign Affairs, Sweden

Catherine A.J. Phinney, Department of National Defence, Canada

Major (GS) Volker Quante, Federal Armed Forces Office for Studies and Exercises (FAFORSE), Germany

M. Reiterer, Vienna Institute for International Law, Austria

Christoph Rohloff, Heidelberg Institute for International Conflict Research (HIK), Germany

David Sandalow, US National Security Council (NSC), USA

Prof. Dr. Cemal Saydam, Middle East Technical University (METU), Turkey

Evita Schmieg, Federal Ministry for Economic Co-operation and Development, Germany

Dr. Brian Shaw, Pacific Northwest National Laboratory (PNNL), USA

Dr. Luminita Stefanescu, Research and Engineering Institute for Environment, Romania

Dr. Atchuk Tchekknavorian, United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), Switzerland

Stanislaw Wilczkowiak, Ministry for Environmental Protection, Natural Resources and Forestry, Poland

S. Wittich, Vienna Institute for International Law, Austria

Pilot Study Participants (in alphabetical order)

Johan Appelberg, Ministry of Defence, Sweden

Carmen Rodriguez Augustin, Ministry of Public Works, Transportation & Environment, Spain

Major Christian Bader, FAFORSE, Germany

Honorable Baktybek Abdrisaev, Embassy of the Kyrgyz Republic

Dr. Richard Ball, Department of Energy (DOE), USA

Marc Bernier, Embassy of France to the United States, France

Günter Blaurock, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Germany

Larry Blotzer, US Army War College, USA

Petr Bogdanov, State Committee of Environmental Protection and Natural Resources, Russia

Harry Boschloo, Ministry of Defence, Netherlands

Winston Bowman, Regional Environmental Center for Central and Eastern Europe (REC), Hungary

Dr. Dexter Bryce, Geo-Centers, Inc., USA

Arunas Cepele, Ministry for Environmental Protection, Lithuania

Dr. Robert Constanza, University of Maryland, USA

George Coyle, Environmental Management Office (EM) of Science & Technology (OST), USA

Regimantas Dauknys, Ministry for Environmental Protection, Lithuania

Nicolas Delcourt, Secretariat General for National Defence (SGDN), France

Kliment Dilianov, Ministry of Environment and Waters, Bulgaria

Neno Dimov, Ministry of Environment and Waters, Bulgaria

Nathalie Diso, Swiss Agency for the Environment, Forests and Landscape, Switzerland

Colonel Waldemar Dziegielewski, Embassy of Poland to the United States, Poland

Victor Egorov, State Ecological Inspection, Moldova

George Fidas, National Intelligence Council (NIC), USA

Erik Fiil, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Denmark

Rear Admiral Thomas R. Fox, USN (ret), Pacific Northwest National Laboratory (PNNL), USA

Dr. Jim Fuller, Pacific Northwest National Laboratory (PNNL), USA

Sergiu Galitchii, State Ecological Inspection, Moldova

William Gallagher, US Department of Defense (DOD), USA

Gebhard Geiger, Science and Policy Foundation Ebenhausen, Germany

Janusz Gesior, Ministry of Defence, Poland

Joanne Gilles, US Embassy Germany, USA

Wendy Grieder, US Environmental Protection Agency (EPA), USA

Dr. Allan Gromow, Ministry of the Environment, Estonia

Joanne Grossi, US Agency for International Development (USAID), USA

Jean Marie Guastavino, Embassy of France, France

Elisabeth Hopkins, IUCN, Switzerland

Rolf Huchthausen, Federal Ministry of Environment, Germany

Col. Michael Hübner, Geneva Center for Security Policy, Switzerland

Prof. Dr. Nejat Ince, The Scientific and Technical Research Council of Turkey (TÜBITAK), Turkey

Jessica Johannesson, Defence Research Establishment, Sweden

Major Dr. Branko Karovski, CVZU, Ministry of Defence, Macedonia

Alexandre Keltchewsky, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, France

Dr. Csaba Kiss, Environmental Security Centre for the Armed Forces, Hungary

Aidan Kirwan, Organisation for Security and Co-operation in Europe (OSCE), Austria

Antti Kivipelto, Ministry of Defence, Finland

Lawerence Koss, US Department of Navy, USA

Kristof Kozak, Ministry for Environment and Regional Policy, Hungary

Petr Kozel, Ministry of Defence, Czech Republic

Dr. Marian Kulesz, Ministry for Environmental Protection-Department of Defence, Poland

Kurt Kunz, Federal Department of Foreign Affairs, Switzerland

Lubomir Kusnir, Ministry of Defence, Slovak Republic

Eduardo Lopez-Busquets, Spanish Delegation to NATO, Spain

Mikael Lindén, National Defence Research Establishment, Sweden

Marek Malecki, Ministry of Defence, Poland

Robyn Matravers, Foundation for a Civil Society, Czech Republic

Christa Sheehan Matthew, Woodrow Wilson Centre, USA

Dr. Richard Matthew, Georgetown University, USA

James McCuaig, Canadian International Development Agency, Canada

Michael McNerney, US Department of Defense (DOD), USA

Lena Melin, National Defence Research Establishment, Sweden

John Mentz, Pacific Northwest National Laboratory (PNNL), USA

Dr. Corneliu A.L. Negulescu, Environmental Research and Engineering Institute, Romania

Nicolas Niemtchinow, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, France

Francois Noisette, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, France

Sule Özkaya, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Turkey

Lee Pasarew, US Environmental Protection Agency, USA

Mikhail Pigoulevski, Ministry of Natural Resources and Environment, Belarus

Risto Rautiainen, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Finland

Dr. Steve Rayner, Pacific Northwest National Laboratory (PNNL), USA

Andres Rekker, Ministry of Defense, Estonia

William Richardson, US Department of State, USA

Armin Ritz, Federal Department of Foreign Affairs, Switzerland

Major Valdemaras Sarapinas, Embassy of Lithuania to the United States, Lithuania

Major Peter Schneider, Federal Armed Forces Office for Studies and Exercises, Germany

Lt. Col. Hans-Jochen Scholz, Federal Ministry of Defence, Germany

Karl Schon, Ministry for Foreign Affairs, Germany

P.J. Simmons, Woodrow Wilson Center, Environmental Change & Security Project, USA

Alexander Semeshko, Ministry of Emergencies, Situations and Population, Belarus

Galina Serger, Pacific Northwest National Laboratory (PNNL), USA

Slawomir Skikor, Ministry of Defence, Poland

Alidrius Sileika, Institute of Environmental Engineering, Lithuania

Prof. Andrejs Silins, Latvian Academy of Sciences, Latvia

Stanislaw Sitnicki, Regional Environment Center, Hungary

Lt. Col. Robert Slockbower, US Army War College, USA

Gazne Soysal, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Turkey

Dr. Detlef Sprinz, Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research (PIK), Germany

Prof. Dr. Jurgis Staniskis, Kaunas University of Technology, Lithuania

Col. Reinhard Streit, US Army Corps of Engineers, Germany

Jernej Stritih, The Regional Environmental Centre for Central and Eastern Europe (REC), Hungary

John Stuart, Ministry of Defence, United Kingdom

Sverre Stub, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Norway

Dr. Stefan Summerer, Federal Environmental Agency, Germany

Francisco Szekely, International Academy of the Environment, Switzerland

Karl Tietmann, Federal Environmental Agency, Germany

Scott Thayer, US Department of State, USA

Aibek Tilebaliev, Embassy of the Kyrgyz Republic to the United States, Kyrgyz Republic

Dr. Chris Tucker, Emergency Preparedness, Canada

Peter von Uleniecki, Ministry of Defence, Germany

Robert Urban, PCCI, Inc., USA

Dr. Arpád Vincze, Zrinyi Miklos University of National Defense, Hungary

Alexandre Vulic, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, France

Marieke Winter, Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Netherlands

Col. Andrzej Wlodarski, National Security Bureau, Poland

Daniel Ziegerer, Swiss Peace Foundation, Switzerland

Pilot Study Peer Reviewers (in alphabetical order)

Col. J.R. Aubry, Department of National Defence, Canada

Dr. Mike Brklacich, Carleton University, Canada

Gretchen DeBoer, Canadian International Development Agency, Canada

Elissa Golberg, Department of Foreign and Affairs and International Trade, Canada

Yvan Jobin, Department of Foreign and Affairs and International Trade, Canada

Dr. Karl Heinz Kamp, Konrad Adenauer Foundation, Germany

Sascha Müller-Kraenner, Heinrich Böll Foundation, Washington DC

Dr. Marc Levy, CIESEN, USA

Dr. Gerhard Petschel-Held, Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research (PIK), Germany

Prof. Dr. Hans-Joachim Schellnhuber, Potsdam Institute for Climate Impact Research (PIK), Germany

Dr. Manuel Schiffler, World Bank, Washington DC

Dr. Aaron T. Wolf, Oregon State University, USA